Meeting: LLC Board

Date: December 11, 2024

Attendees

LLC Board:

Roman Danyliw
Jason Livingood
Mirjam Kühne
Sean Turner
Shauna Turner

Staff/Secretariat:

Sean Croghan
Jay Daley
Sandy Ginoza
Jean Mahoney
Stephanie McCammon
Cindy Morgan
Laura Nugent
Debbie Sasser
Robert Sparks
Lisa Winkler
Greg Wood

Observers/Guests:

Dean Bogdanović
Alper Kamil Demir
Dave Lawrence
David Millman

Scribe:

Michelle Cotton

Conflicts of Interest Declared:

A revised CoI form will be posted for Sean Turner.

Part I: Open to the Public

1. Record e-vote results

One e-vote has been completed since the previous Board meeting.

 a. The November 20, 2024 LLC Board Meeting minutes were approved with the board e-voting as follows:

> Roman Danyliw: No vote
> Mirjam Kühne: YES
> Jason Livingood: YES
> Sean Turner: YES
> Shauna Turner: YES

2. Review & approve prior month's financial statement

Debbie Sasser reported the October 2024 Financial Statements were circulated a few weeks ago. These will be sent to e-vote after this meeting. November 2024 Financial Statements are still being reviewed and should be circulated soon.

3. Update on the IETF's technical work

Roman Danyliw reports that in the fall the IAB hosted an AI preferences workshop with Chatham House rules. It was very successful and has now converted into a chartering exercise. The IESG is partway through the process to charter a new working group. It's uncommon for an IAB workshop to go to a chartering exercise so quickly. This demonstrates all the interest in this topic. The AI preferences working group is going to standardize building blocks that allow for the expression of preferences about how content is collected and processed for artificial intelligence, model development, deployment and use.

4. ICANN Board Liaison Report

Dave Lawrence reports ICANN just completed its' Annual General Meeting (AGM) in Istanbul. Dave officially started his role as the ICANN Board Liaison to the IETF at the end of that meeting. There is not much to report as of yet.

Public Executive Director Report

For the IETF Administration LLC Board meeting on 1 December 2024

This report is provided by the IETF Executive Director and is read through at the meeting as it is not available to observers. This report is public. Confidential matters are covered in a separate confidential report.

1.   Strategic Matters

Nothing to report.

2.   Policies

Staff policy

I have drafted a very short staff policy that covers a small number of gaps in our existing policies and which are too small to be separate policies. This is an operational policy and so requires board approval.

Recommendation: That the board approve the staff policy as an operational policy. This will be sent to e-vote after the meeting.

3.   Finance

Budget 2025

Consultation of the budget has not commenced, pending a board decision on registration fees. Assuming approval is given for the fee increase then the board will be asked to approve the draft budget for consultation in the Board + ED section of the board meeting. If that is approved, then the following timetable will apply:

- Dec 12, 2024: Draft budget issued for community consultation. This will need to be at least five weeks given the holiday season

- Jan 17, 2025: Consultation closes
- Feb 12, 2025: Approval of final budget

In Board-ED time, the Board will discuss options for expediting review and approval of the budget.

4.   RFPs and contracts

RPC renewal

This is to be discussed in the Board + ED section of the board meeting.

NOC management resources

Discussions have begun with a small group of NOC volunteers on the structure of a future RFP for NOC management resources and progress has been quick. It should be possible to go to RFP in the first quarter of 2025.

5.   Meetings

Meeting statistics

As noted in a recent complaint to the board, the statistics shown in Datatracker for meeting attendance are incorrect. This problem has been known about since 2022 and the plan is to replace the stats module entirely. The option of adding a disclaimer has been considered but the level of effort required would be similar to removing the module entirely.

The incorrect data has been removed from the Datatracker and the correct data is available on the main website, for example this list for IETF 121 Dublin.

IETF 125, possibly in China

This is covered in the Confidential ED report. We are experiencing difficulties negotiating with the venue and may need to consider alternatives.

The Board discussed this further and noted that the difficulty is not with the desire to go to this location or anywhere else in China, it is with the costs associated with the venue and the negotiating approach that venue has taken. The Board supports a meeting in

China and if it does not happen for this venue, there are future Asia meeting slots and other venues in China that may work better. In the meantime, the Board encouraged the ED to work quickly on alternatives. The ED noted that a consultation regarding cities in India was currently open and this will be discussed later in closed session.

New participant program

Active planning is underway for the major update to the new participant program previously reported on and planned for IETF 122 Bangkok.

Registration fee increases for 2025

We last increased the registration fees in July 2023, following a report to the community [1] and consultation. The increase was based on US inflation in the eight years since the previous increase, to January 2023, resulting in a rise of ~25% across the board

At that time, the board set a policy that the fees should be increased annually, during the annual budget process, using US inflation since the last increase. Unfortunately, this was not followed for the 2024 financial year, meaning that the rise this year will be slightly higher to compensate.

The fees have been reviewed using the official US inflation calculator [2], which gives the inflation rate from January 2023 to October 2024 (latest) as 5.51%. Using that for the increase, and with some rounding, we get the following proposed fees, to be effective from July 2025:

		ONSITE			REMOTE		
		Current	Proposed	Actual %	Remote	Proposed	Actual %
Week							
	Super Early	$875	$925	5.71%	$250	$264	5.60%
	Early	$1,095	$1,155	5.48%	$310	$327	5.48%
	Standard	$1,200	$1,265	5.42%	$360	$380	5.56%
One Day							
	Super Early	$470	$495	5.32%	$140	$148	5.71%
	Early	$590	$620	5.08%	$170	$180	5.88%
	Standard	$645	$680	5.43%	$200	$210	5.00%
Student		$150	$160	6.67%	$55	$58	5.45%

The onsite student fee has been $150 since at least 2006, which is why the increase is slightly higher than inflation.

[1] https://www.ietf.org/media/documents/IETF_Meeting_Fee_Review_2023.pdf
[2] https://www.bls.gov/data/inflation_calculator.htm

The board is asked to **approve** the regular cost-of-inflation increase in registration fees (covered in Board + ED section of the agenda).

6.   Tools/RPC/RSWG/RSCE

New on-demand development resource

We are trialling a new software development resource, a collective of Ukrainian developers, on a small project. The ED does have to run a final check to ensure there are no potential sanctions issues.

7.   IESG/IAB/IRTF/Trust

IESG/IAB support

Nothing to report.

IETF Trust transition to the IPMC

The IETF Trust chair recently met with the ICANN IPR Community Consultation Group (CCG) to discuss this transition and in particular, the move of the IANA IPR (trademark and domain name) from the IETF Trust to the IPMC. This group is composed of representatives from the protocol community (appointed by the IAB), names community and IP address community. Most of the members were in favour, but some strong concerns were raised by one member of the names community regarding community safeguards.

The next step is for ICANN counsel to provide their opinion, after which the various communities will be asked for formal approval.

# 8.	Communications/Outreach

L4S and Gaming industry

We have started work on an industry brief, for our website, aimed at the gaming industry, which is expected to highlight L4S. This is a trial to see if we can assemble the necessary information from existing IETF participants and use that to approach people in industries that do not traditionally participate in the IETF, for funds.

Collateral and materials development

Two year-end reports are in development and expected to be complete by the end of January 2025. A first edition of an "IETF Sponsorship Report" will recognize sponsors of the IETF in 2024, as well as highlight the activities sponsorship supported and the general benefit the IETF's work has for the global Internet by providing an example of widely deployed technology. A 2024 IETF Snapshot will provide a select set of data about IETF activities during the 2024, as [past editions](#) have done.

# 9.	Fundraising

Global hosts

Discussions are at an advanced stage with two organisations that are considering becoming global hosts.

# 10.	Miscellaneous

Nothing to report.

---

6. Fixing Meeting Statistics

Jay Daley described the issue in the Executive Director Report and the incorrect data has been deleted.

7. Changing Board Roles

As of January 1, 2025 the board will change roles as expected under the [succession plan](#). Mirjam Kühne will become the chair and Jason Livingood will become vice chair. Shauna Turner will become treasurer and Sean Turner will become vice treasurer.

8. AOB & Questions from Observers

None

Part II: Board + Senior Staff

1. 2025 LLC Board Retreat planning

The board discussed the timing of the 2025 retreat. Michelle Cotton will begin sending out potential dates. Locations will be suggested as soon as the new board members are confirmed.

2. Confidential Executive Director Report

Jay Daley shared a confidential report regarding planning IETF 125 relating to difficult venue negotiations. The Board encouraged expedited exploration of alternatives.

Part III: Board + ED Only

1. Final discussion & vote on annual cost-of-inflation fee increases

This was approved.

2. Approval of draft budget for consultation

This was approved with an accelerated timeframe.

3. RPC Renewal decision

The board pre-authorized the Executive Director to contract.

4. Present final IASA2 document - vote on release

This was approved.

5. Discussion of Executive Director (ED) Goals and Self-Assessment

The Board briefly discussed any open questions with the ED's annual performance self-assessment.

6. AOB

N/A

Part IV: Board Only

1. Review of Executive Director (ED) Goals and Self-Assessment

The Board discussed the ED's self-assessment and annual performance review and agreed upon annual incentive pay, as well as regular annual feedback for the ED.

2. AOB

Shauna Turner provided an update regarding the NomCom.